**JOGO paper -comments**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| От кого: | **Panos Pardalos**<p.m.pardalos@gmail.com> |
| Кому: | Vyacheslav Chistyakov <czeslaw@mail.ru> |
| Копии: | Panos Pardalos <p.m.pardalos@gmail.com> |

4 марта 2013, 10:59

Date: 23 Dec 2011  
To: "Boris Goldengorin" [b.goldengorin@rug.nl](https://e.mail.ru/cgi-bin/sentmsg?compose&To=b.goldengorin@rug.nl)  
From: "Journal of Global Optimization (JOGO)" [Rameshbabu.Rathinam@springer.com](https://e.mail.ru/cgi-bin/sentmsg?compose&To=Rameshbabu.Rathinam@springer.com)  
Subject: accept but incomplete - revise  
Dear Boris,  
  
We are pleased to inform you that your submission Extremal Values of  
Global Tolerances in Combinatorial Optimization with an Additive  
Objective Function has been accepted for publication in  
Journal of Global Optimization  
  
However, before your paper can be forwarded to our Production  
Department, you are requested to make the  
corrections as suggested by P.M. Pardalos  
  
In order to submit your corrected manuscript, please access  
the following web site:  
  
<http://jogo.edmgr.com/>  
  
We look forward to receiving your final version of your manuscript.  
  
With kind regards,  
  
P.M. Pardalos  
  
Comments from the Editor:  
  
Reviewer #1: In this paper the authors present a theory on global  
tolerances. In specific, the paper is devoted to global upper and  
lower tolerances in optimization problems. The paper has novel ideas  
involved in it; however, the main drawback of this paper is the  
presentation and the language.  
For example, punctuation on the very first sentence of the paper is  
missing. Most of the time, the sentences are too long, which makes it  
complex and confusing to understand the motive(even there are spelling  
mistakes), for example:  
\* Although the tolernaces have been used for a straightforward  
enumeration of the k-best solutions for some natural k [15] including  
the Max-Regret heuristic for solving the Three-Index Assignment  
Problem [1]. In fact, the notion of k-best solution contains the idea  
of a complete enumeration of the whole set of feasible solutions in a  
non-decreasing order of their objective function values.  
  
\* If such an enumeration is executed for a relaxed version of the  
original combinatorial optimization problem, then the first feasible  
solution to the original problem, i.e., the problem with some  
additional relaxed constraints, returns an optimal solution to the  
original problem.  
  
\* In Section 3 we introduce global tolerances of the ground set  
elements and present their principal properties including  
relationships with commonly known tolerances.  
  
Moreover, in section 2, the following sentences needs to be rewritten:  
  
\* Let X be a finite set of cardinality |X| ?..  
  
\* A Combinatorial Optimization Problem determined by the data  
(X;C;S; fC), abbreviated as COP (X;C;S; f ), or simply COP, if no  
ambiguity arises, is to minimize or maximize the objective function f  
on S.  
  
\* In order to be more specific, in this paper we concentrate on  
the minimization problem: find sets  
  
\* is the of all common arcs  
  
\* The following observation will be of some use below:  
  
In Section 3, the first sentence is too long. Many sentences like the  
ones highlighted above can be extracted from the manuscript.  
Therefore, it is strongly recommended to re-write the complex  
sentences throughout the manuscript. Readability of a mathematical  
paper (containing theory) is very important, and it will play a major  
role in future citations.  
  
In addition to the language and punctuations, the manuscript lacks  
examples. Some of the complex ideas can be illustrated by a short and  
simple example. Authors are recommended to add some examples to  
illustrate the complex ideas. Moreover, the manuscript needs a  
separate section devoted to conclusion. Both introduction and  
conclusion sections will provide a motivation for the reader. As a  
suggestive recommendation, the introductory section of the manuscript  
should highlight the reasons that make the study of tolerances useful  
in real life problems. Furthermore, the conclusion section should  
highlight the achievements/novelties in the manuscript, and should  
present future research directions for the reader.